

Mr Simon Stevens
Chief Executive
NHS England

23 February 2015

Dear Simon

Re: Consideration of Treatment Options for Chronic Eye Conditions in the NHS

The NHS is currently facing the greatest financial challenge since its creation in 1948 and this pressure will continue for the foreseeable future. In your recent report, "The NHS five year forward view", you have described an annual £30 billion gap between available funding and predicted demand for health services by 2020. This comes after five years of the lowest ever growth in NHS funding and austerity measures designed to meet the £20 billion "Nicholson challenge".

You will be aware that CCGs have the responsibility for commissioning the majority of NHS healthcare and for ensuring that every pound is spent to best effect, and that this involves clinicians in CCGs making complex decisions on the allocation of resources and the relative availability of treatments. When considering these decisions clinicians leading commissioning organisations have the responsibility for balancing the needs of the individual with the needs of the wider community.

You will be well aware that CCG's are bound by the requirement to provide drugs recommended by NICE where NICE Technology Appraisal guidance exists. Whilst CCGs recognise and value the benefits of NICE's role in the NHS, sometimes an unintended consequence of Technology Appraisal guidance can be to effectively enforce prioritisation of resources away from other effective treatments in favour of those recommended by NICE. We believe that in the case of Technology Appraisal Guidance relating to the treatment of chronic eye conditions with ranubizumab (Lucentis) and aflibercept (Eylea), this re-prioritisation of resources has now become disproportionate.

There is no doubt that the advent of medicines to treat chronic degenerative eye conditions is something to be celebrated, and that many people's sight has been saved as a result. However, we believe that in the case of these products a number of factors have conspired to create a financial situation that has now become untenable for CCGs and indeed for the NHS at large, and we are writing to you to both raise the profile of the issues and to request your support to expedite a national solution. We are writing concurrently to the Secretary of State for Health, copied to NICE, and to the General Medical Council as we recognise that collective action between a number of national bodies will be required.

The issues relate to the position of the NHS regarding another product that can be used successfully to treat these conditions, bevacizumab (Avastin). Avastin is licenced for use in bowel cancer but it has been used "off licence" to treat wet AMD (and a range of other chronic eye conditions) in a wide range of settings since 2005. Genentech, the manufacturer of Avastin, subsequently developed the related product Lucentis and successfully obtained a licence for this latter product to be used in patients with wet AMD, and subsequently a range of other eye conditions. Roche, which now owns Avastin, has decided not to apply for a licence for the use of Avastin to treat any eye conditions.

Thus once Lucentis became available in the UK and received positive NICE Technology Appraisal guidance as the only product licensed in the market for this indication, it became the default option for treatment. None of this would matter if it were not for the fact that Genentech (as above, subsequently purchased by Roche) priced Lucentis at between 10-20 times as much as the original drug Avastin. This has huge consequences for the finances of the NHS as the incidence of these chronic eye conditions is increasing each year due to an aging population and the treatment can extend to the lifetime of many patients. Whilst it is hard to give a precise figure of the actual excess cost that the NHS is paying each year we can be certain that it will run into hundreds of millions of pounds. We believe the subsequent pricing of the product Eylea is an example of 'me too' pricing, the precedent having been set by the price of Lucentis in the market.

There have been a number of significant events in this story over the last few years. In 2012 two trials (CATT in the USA and IVAN in the UK) published their results after two years of study. They demonstrated comparable effectiveness between Avastin and Lucentis. In September 2014 a Cochrane Review was published that noted comparable safety between both drugs.

Avastin is widely used in the USA to treat a range of eye conditions, and in recent months the Italian and French governments have taken action at central government level to ensure that Avastin is available in place of Lucentis across their respective nationally funded health systems. In May 2014 Italy's Ministry of Health said it was seeking €1.2bn in damages from Roche and Novartis for colluding to prevent doctors using Avastin to treat wet AMD, taking the lead from an earlier antitrust investigation that resulted in the levying of a €182.5m fine. Meanwhile, France and the EU have both indicated interest in pursuing their own further investigations into the companies' dealings regarding these products.

A recent editorial in the BMJ titled, "What is stopping the NHS from using Avastin for macular degeneration and other retinal disorders? Government must act to remove the hurdles" was published on 19 November 2014. The editorial stated:

Commissioners are expected to enact NICE guidance, and NICE has not considered Avastin. This makes it difficult to commission the use of Avastin and to deprive patients of NICE sanctioned treatment. Furthermore, the General Medical Council (GMC) states that doctors should prescribe unlicensed drugs only if "there is no suitably licensed medicine that will meet the patient's need. "Without unequivocal GMC and NICE support, ophthalmologists are understandably concerned that they may be assuming unacceptable personal liability by using an unlicensed drug when a licensed alternative exists. Where these concerns don't exist, ophthalmologists are happy to prescribe Avastin. For example, Avastin is the market leading drug for neovascular AMD in the US. Closer to home, in Guernsey, where NICE guidance does not apply, Avastin is the only therapy commissioned for the treatment of neovascular AMD "Until Avastin has been appraised (by NICE) the GMC must also be unambiguous in supporting doctors who use the off-label drug instead of licensed alternatives."

To conclude, we believe the current situation in England places clinical commissioners and clinicians treating these conditions in an invidious position. If they commission or use Avastin, a drug with the potential to provide safe and effective treatment at a cost that is many hundreds

of millions of pounds less to the NHS at large, they will find themselves in conflict with NICE and the GMC.

We have therefore written to the GMC to ask for their support in providing a specific exception to their standard guidance to support practitioners who wish to prescribe Avastin for use in the eye. We have also written to the Secretary of State for Health to request that he considers the status of the current Technology Appraisal guidance in light of the issues described, that he authorises NICE to undertake a Multiple Technology Appraisal (MTA) review looking at the comparative cost effectiveness of Avastin, Lucentis and Eylea, and, given the time that it will take to conduct this MTA we request that he also commits to provide support to Clinical Commissioners who wish to make local commissioning decisions to prescribe Avastin in place of the NICE mandated products Lucentis and Eylea.

The Royal College of Ophthalmologists has issued a recent statement in which it states that '...The current situation is divesting the NHS of funds that could be put to better use.... The college would therefore welcome an urgent review of this issue by the UK's regulatory bodies to consider how this unusual situation can be remedied.' Their full statement is available at <http://tinyurl.com/pz7soxx>

We the undersigned, as the commissioners of the services are therefore calling upon you as the leader of NHS England to:

1. Support our case for change with the Secretary of State for Health, the GMC, and NICE.
2. To provide support to Clinical Commissioners who wish to make local commissioning decisions to prescribe Avastin in place of the NICE mandated products Lucentis and Eylea, on the grounds that this is a safe and cost effective alternative treatment that can save the NHS hundreds of millions of pounds which can be reinvested in patient care

Yours sincerely

CCG Chief Clinical Officers & Clinical Chairs

Dr Phil Pue, Chief Clinical Officer
**NHS Airedale, Wharfedale & Craven
CCG**

Dr Graham Jackson, Clinical Leader &
Chair
NHS Aylesbury Vale CCG

Dr Stephen Kell, Clinical Chair
NHS Bassetlaw CCG

Dr Paul Hassan, Chief Clinical Officer
NHS Bedfordshire CCG

Dr Howard Stoate, Chair
NHS Bexley CCG

Dr Amanda Doyle, Chief Clinical Officer
NHS Blackpool CCG

Dr Akram Khan, Clinical Chair
NHS Bradford City CCG

Dr Andy Withers, Clinical Chair
NHS Bradford Districts CCG

Dr Andrew Parson, Chair
NHS Bromley CCG

Dr Neil Modha, Chief Clinical Officer
**NHS Cambridgeshire & Peterborough
CCG**

Dr Caz Sayer, Chair
NHS Camden CCG

Dr Ruth O'Hare, Chair
NHS Central London CCG

Dr Mike Eeckelaers, Chair
NHS Central Manchester CCG

Dr Annet Gamell, Chief Clinical Officer
NHS Chiltern CCG

Dr Gora Bangi, Chair
NHS Chorley & South Ribble CCG

Dr Clare Highton, Clinical Chair
NHS City & Hackney CCG

Dr Katie Armstrong, Clinical Chief Officer
NHS Coastal West Sussex CCG

Dr Miten Ruparelia, Clinical Vice Chair
NHS Corby CCG

Dr Amit Bhargava, Clinical Chief Officer
NHS Crawley

Dr Stewart Findlay, Chief Clinical Officer
NHS Durham Dales, Easington & Sedgefield (DDES) CCG

Dr Mohini Parmar, Chair
NHS Ealing CCG

Dr Andy Ker, Vice Clinical Chair
Dr Richard Palin, Vice Clinical Chair
NHS East Leicestershire & Rutland CCG

Dr Patrick Kerr, Assistant Clinical Chair
NHS East Surrey CCG

Dr Martin Writer, Clinical Chair
NHS Eastbourne, Hailsham & Seaford CCG

Dr Mo Abedi, Chair
NHS Enfield CCG

Dr Markus Henn, Clinical Vice Chair
Dr Avi Bhatia, Chair
NHS Erewash CCG

Dr David Chilvers, Clinical Chair
NHS Fareham & Gosport CCG

Dr Tony Naughton, Clinical Chief Officer
NHS Fylde and Wyre CCG

Dr Mark Dornan, Chair
NHS Gateshead CCG

Dr Helen Miller, Clinical Chair
NHS Gloucestershire CCG

Dr Ann Bowman, Chair & Clinical Leader
NHS Greater Preston CCG

Dr Ellen Wright, Chair
NHS Greenwich CCG

Dr David Eyre-Brook, Chair
NHS Guildford and Waverley CCG

Dr Cliff Richards, Chair
NHS Halton CCG

Dr Vicky Pleydell, Clinical Chief Officer
NHS Hambleton, Richmondshire & Whitby CCG

Dr Tim Spicer, Chair
NHS Hammersmith & Fulham CCG

Dr Steve Lloyd, Chair
NHS Hardwick CCG

Dr Sherry Tang, Chair
NHS Haringey CCG

Dr Alistair Ingram, Clinical Chair
NHS Harrogate & Rural District CCG

Dr Boleslaw Posmyk, Chair
NHS Hartlepool & Stockton on Tees CCG

Dr Roger Elias, (Clinical) Chair
NHS Hastings & Rotherham CCG

Dr Nicolas Small, Chair
NHS Herts Valley CCG

Dr Chris Duffy, Clinical Chair
NHS Heywood, Middleton & Rochdale CCG

Dr Elizabeth Gill, Clinical Chair
NHS High Weald, Lewes & Havens CCG

Dr Minesh Patel, Clinical Chair
NHS Horsham & Mid Sussex

Dr Nicola Burbidge, Chair
NHS Hounslow CCG

Dr John Rivers, Chair & Clinical Lead
NHS Isle of Wight CCG

Dr Gillian Greenhough, Chair
NHS Islington CCG

Dr Colin Philip, Chair
NHS Kernow CCG

Dr Naz Jivani, Clinical Chair
Dr Phil Moore, Clinical Deputy Chair
NHS Kingston CCG

Dr Adrian McLachlan, Chair
NHS Lambeth CCG

Dr Alex Gaw, Clinical Chair
NHS Lancashire North CCG

Dr Jason Broch, Clinical Chair
NHS Leeds North CCG

Dr Andy Harris, Clinical Chief Officer
NHS Leeds South & East CCG

Dr Marc Rowland, Chair
NHS Lewisham CCG

Dr Brynne Massey, Clinical Lead & Chair
NHS Lincolnshire East CCG

Dr Sunil Hindocha, Chief Clinical Officer
NHS Lincolnshire West CCG

Dr Nadim Fazlani, Chair
NHS Liverpool CCG

Dr Caroline Dollery, Clinical Chair
NHS Mid Essex CCG

Dr Nicola Smith, Chair
NHS Milton Keynes CCG

Dr Tim Burke, Clinical Chair
**NHS NEW (North, East, West) Devon
CCG**

Dr Abid Irfan, Chair/Clinical Lead
NHS Newbury & District CCG

Dr Steve Summers, Chair
NHS Newcastle East CCG

Dr Guy Pilkington, Chair
NHS Newcastle West CCG

Dr Zuhair Zarifa, Chair
NHS Newham CCG

Dr Rod Smith, Chair
NHS North & West Reading CCG

Dr Ben Milton, Clinical Chair
NHS North Derbyshire CCG

Dr Neil O'Brien, Clinical Chief Officer
NHS North Durham CCG

Dr Shane Gordon, Clinical Chief Officer
NHS North East Essex CCG

Dr Martin Whiting, Clinical Accountable
Officer
NHS North Manchester CCG

Dr Anoop Dhesi, Chair
NHS North Norfolk CCG

Dr Mary Backhouse, Chief Clinical Officer
NHS North Somerset CCG

Dr John Matthews, Clinical Chair
NHS North Tyneside CCG

Dr Liz Lawn, Chair
NHS North West Surrey CCG

Dr Alistair Blair, Clinical Chief Officer
NHS Northumberland CCG

Dr Chris Price, Clinical Chair
NHS Norwich CCG

Dr Hugh Porter, Clinical Chair
NHS Nottingham City CCG

Dr Paul Oliver, Chair & Clinical Lead
NHS Nottingham North & East CCG

Dr Guy Mansford, Chief Clinical Officer
NHS Nottingham West CCG

Dr Joe McManners, Clinical Chair
NHS Oxfordshire CCG

Dr Julie Kitlowski, Chair
NHS Rotherham CCG

Dr Stephen Shortt, Clinical Lead
NHS Rushcliffe CCG

Dr Tim Moorhead, Chair
NHS Sheffield CCG

Dr Matthew Dolman, Chair
NHS Somerset CCG

Dr Andrew Wilson, Chair
NHS South Cheshire CCG

Dr Sam Barrell, Chief Clinical Officer
Dr Derek Greatorex, Clinical Chair
NHS South Devon & Torbay CCG

Dr Barbara Rushton, Clinical Chair
NHS South Eastern Hampshire CCG

Dr Darren Cocker, Clinical Chair
NHS South Kent Coast CCG

Dr Kevin Hill, Chair
NHS South Lincolnshire CCG

Dr Bill Tamkin, Chair
NHS South Manchester CCG

Dr Janet Walker, Clinical Chair
NHS South Tees CCG

Dr Ishak Nadeem, Chair
NHS South Reading CCG

Dr Clive Shaw, Chair
NHS South Sefton CCG

Dr Vindi Bhandal, Chair
NHS South West Lincolnshire CCG

Dr Steve Townsend, Clinical Chair
NHS Southampton City CCG

Dr José Garcia, Clinical Chair
NHS Southend CCG

Dr Sheila Newport, Chair
NHS Southern Derbyshire CCG

Dr Rob Caudwell, Chair
NHS Southport & Formby CCG

Dr Jonty Heaversedge, Chair
NHS Southwark CCG

Dr Anne-Marie Houlder, Chair
NHS Staffordshire Surrounds

Dr Ranjit Gill, Chief Clinical Officer
NHS Stockport CCG

Dr Ian Pattison, Clinical Chair
NHS Sunderland CCG

Dr Claire Fuller, Clinical Chair
NHS Surrey Downs CCG

Dr Andy Brooks, Chief Officer (Clinical)
NHS Surrey Heath CCG

Dr C Elliott, Chief Clinical Officer
Dr Brendan Hudson, Chair
NHS Sutton CCG

Dr Sam Everington, Clinical Chair
NHS Tower Hamlets CCG

Dr Liz Clarke, Clinical Lead
NHS Trafford CCG

Dr Mark Hayes, Chief Clinical Officer
NHS Vale of York CCG

Dr Jonathan Griffiths, Chair
NHS Vale Royal CCG

Dr Phil Earnshaw, Clinical Chair
NHS Wakefield CCG

Dr Anwar Khan, Clinical Chair
NHS Waltham Forest CCG

Dr Nicola Jones, Clinical Chair
NHS Wandsworth CCG

Dr Rob Gerlis, Chair
NHS West Essex CCG

Dr Sarah Schofield, Clinical Chair
NHS West Hampshire CCG

Dr Bob Bowes, Chair
NHS West Kent CCG

Dr Fiona Butler, Chair
NHS West London CCG

Dr Ian Mack, Chair
NHS West Norfolk CCG

Dr CJ Browning, Chair
NHS West Suffolk CCG

Dr Stephen Rowlands, Clinical Chair
NHS Wiltshire CCG

Dr Johan Zylstra, Chair
NHS Wokingham CCG